



MEETING TITLE Trust Board – Meeting in Public		MEETING DATE 26/03/2013	
TITLE of PAPER NHS Staff Survey Results		PAPER REF	5.8
STRATEGIC OBJECTIVE		To create, attract and retain an enhanced and skilled workforce to meet service needs now and in the future To develop culture, systems and processes to support continuous improvement and innovation To deliver clinically effective services which exceed regulatory and legislative standards	
PURPOSE OF THE PAPER		The purpose of the report is to provide the Trust Board with an overview of the results from the 2012 NHS Staff Survey and highlight areas where improvements have been made and where further improvement is required.	
For Approval		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	For Assurance
For Decision		<input type="checkbox"/>	Discussion/Information
AUTHOR / LEAD	Stephen Moir, Deputy Chief Executive/Executive Director of Workforce & Strategy	ACCOUNTABLE DIRECTOR	Deputy Chief Executive/Executive Director of Workforce & Strategy
PREVIOUSLY CONSIDERED BY		Committee/Group: Workforce Governance Group	Date: 18 th March 2013
RECOMMENDATION		The report recommends that the Trust Board receives and approves the results of the NHS Staff Survey for 2012.	
RISK ASSESSMENT			
Corporate Risk Register and/or Board Assurance Framework amended			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No
Resource Implications (Financial, Workforce, other - specify)			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Legal implications/Regulatory requirements			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No
Quality and Diversity Implications			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
ASSURANCE/COMPLIANCE			
Care Quality Commission Registration Outcome(s)		13: Staffing 14: Supporting workers	
NHSLA Risk Management Standards for Ambulance Trusts		3: Competent & Capable Workforce Not Applicable Not Applicable	

1. PURPOSE/AIM

- 1.1 The purpose of the report is to provide the Trust Board with an overview of the results from the 2012 NHS Staff Survey and highlight areas where improvements have been made and where further improvement is required.

2. BACKGROUND/CONTEXT

- 2.1 The NHS Staff Survey is an important means by which the experience of staff at work and their engagement with patients, colleagues and managers are explored. NHS organisations are obliged to conduct the survey every year and have an opportunity to add local questions to those which are set nationally.
- 2.2 Research from Aston University shows clearly that staff engagement correlates both with patient satisfaction and mortality rates. Engagement is increasingly seen as the best predictor of NHS trust outcomes, with engaged staff twice as likely to feel able to influence service delivery and patient experience.
- 2.3 Research further demonstrates that enabling staff to express their opinions helps to achieve enhanced levels of staff engagement. The NHS Staff Survey provides one such route for staff to express their views and perceptions by exploring their work experiences, and their engagement with patients, colleagues and managers.
- 2.4 The core questionnaire used for the survey follows a standard format nationally for all Trusts. The Care Quality Commission (CQC) uses the results of this core survey to inform their assessment of NHS Trusts. For 2012, this core questionnaire was reviewed, and reduced in length.
- 2.5 For 2012, Trusts had the opportunity to survey by using the shorter core questionnaire alone, adding optional modules of pre-designed questions supplied by the survey co-ordinator, or developing their own sets of bespoke questions to cover areas of interest to the individual Trust. For the 2012 survey, the Yorkshire Ambulance Service NHS Trust (YAS) embraced this opportunity to specifically include a range of local questions covering the following areas:
- Line Management
 - Personal impact
 - Flexible working
 - Organisational vision and values
 - Health and wellbeing
 - Foundation Trust
 - Patient experience
 - Internal communications

- 2.7 In the wake of the public inquiry by Robert Francis QC into the failings within the Mid Staffordshire Hospitals NHS Foundation Trust, there is an increasing awareness of the importance of the messages to NHS institutions from their staff survey results. Consistently low engagement scores are increasingly seen as warning signs about the robustness and effectiveness of NHS organisations, with consequences both for patient care and patient satisfaction. Both the Department of Health and NHS Employers have indicated their determination to support improvements to engagement levels and scores within the NHS as a whole, as a key factor in raising standards of service, of patient outcomes and patient satisfaction.
- 2.8 The results from the Staff Survey also need to be seen against the four pledges setting out what staff should expect from the NHS as an employer, embodied in the 2009 NHS Constitution:

Pledge 1:

To provide all staff with clear roles and responsibilities and rewarding jobs for teams and individuals that make a difference to patients, their families and carers, and to communities.

Pledge 2:

To provide all staff with personal development plans, access to appropriate training for their jobs and the support of line management to succeed.

Pledge 3:

To provide support and opportunities for staff to maintain their health, wellbeing and safety

Pledge 4:

To engage staff in decisions that affect them and the services they provide, individually, through representative organisations and through local partnership working arrangements. All staff will be empowered to put forward ways to deliver better and safer services for patients and their families.

3. SUMMARY OF YAS KEY FINDINGS FROM 2012 NHS STAFF SURVEY

- 3.1 A total of 479 staff at the Yorkshire Ambulance Service NHS Trust participated in the survey in 2012, which was a 58% response rate based upon a random sample of 833 staff. The overall response rate to the survey increased by 3% from 2011 to 2012.
- 3.2 The overall indicator score for staff engagement arising from the NHS Staff Survey is presented on a scale of 1 to 5, where poor engagement is towards the lower end of the scale and strong engagement is towards the upper end of the scale.

- 3.3 For YAS, the 2012 overall staff engagement indicator score was **3.20**, which represented a slight improvement upon the 2011 result of **3.18**. However, this still places the Trust in a below average position when compared to other ambulance trusts.
- 3.4 The overall indicator of staff engagement is calculated utilising the data drawn from questions that represent the following key findings:
- Staff ability to contribute towards improvements at work;
 - Staff recommendation of the trust as a place to work or receive treatment;
 - Staff motivation at work.
- 3.5 In two out of these three key finding areas used to calculate the overall engagement score for YAS no change was experienced between the 2011 and 2012 results. In the third area, staff ability to contribute towards improvements at work, YAS achieved a positive improvement in 2012.
- 3.6 The following areas were considered to be the top 5 most favourable findings for YAS compared to other ambulance trusts in England for 2012:
- *Percentage of staff experiencing harassment, bullying or abuse from patients, relatives or the public in the last 12 months:* YAS score of 44% compared to an average score of 47% for ambulance trusts.
 - *Percentage of staff working extra hours:* YAS score of 83% compared to an average score of 84% for ambulance trusts.
 - *Percentage of staff agreeing that their role makes a difference to patients:* YAS score of 88% compared to an average score of 87% for ambulance trusts.
 - *Percentage of staff experiencing harassment, bullying or abuse from staff within the last 12 months:* YAS score of 22% compared with national average score of 28% for ambulance trusts.
 - *Percentage of staff witnessing potentially harmful errors, near misses or incidents in the last month:* YAS score of 35% compared with national average score of 38% for ambulance trusts.
- 3.7 The following areas were considered to be the 5 least favourable findings compared to other ambulance trusts in England for 2012:

- *Percentage of staff reporting good communication between senior management and staff:* YAS score of 12% compared with a national average score of 16% for ambulance trusts.
- *Percentage of staff able to contribute towards improvements at work:* YAS score of 36% compared to national average score of 44% for ambulance trusts.
- *Support from immediate managers:* YAS score of 3.06, on a scale of 1 to 5, compared to a national average score of 3.21 for ambulance trusts.
- *Percentage of staff receiving job-relevant training, learning or development in the last 12 months:* YAS score of 65% compared to a national average score of 75% for ambulance trusts.
- *Percentage of staff feeling pressure in last 3 months to attend work when feeling unwell:* YAS score of 43% compared to a national average of 38% for ambulance trusts.

3.8 The largest positive local changes achieved since the 2011 survey for YAS against key findings were as follows:

- *Percentage of staff able to contribute to improvements at work:* increased from 27% in 2011 to 36% in 2012.
- *Percentage of staff appraised in the last 12 months:* increased from 67% in 2011 to 74% in 2012.

3.9 The key findings where staff experience has deteriorated since the 2011 survey for YAS were as follows:

- *Percentage of staff reporting errors, near misses or incidents witnessed in the last month:* reduction from 91% in 2011 to 78% in 2012.
- *Percentage of staff suffering from work-related stress in last 12 months:* increase from 33% in 2011 to 48% in 2012.
- *Percentage of staff having well-structured appraisals in last 12 months:* reduction from 23% in 2011 to 16% in 2012.
- *Percentage of staff having equality and diversity training in last 12 months:* reduction from 42% in 2011 to 30% in 2012.

- *Percentage of staff receiving health and safety training in last 12 months: reduction from 52% in 2011 to 44% in 2012.*
- 3.10 The full and summary reports pertaining to the Yorkshire Ambulance Service NHS Trust Staff Survey for 2012, and all other ambulance trusts, can be viewed on the NHS Staff Survey Co-ordination Centre website at:

<http://nhsstaffsurveys.com/cms/index.php?page=ambulance-trusts-2>

4. HEADLINE COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS OF 2012 STAFF SURVEY RESULTS FOR AMBULANCE SERVICES

- 4.1 The average employee engagement score for all ambulance trusts in 2012 was 3.29, compared with an average for all NHS trusts of 3.68. While both figures are an improvement on the 2011 scores, the increase for all trusts, at +0.07 was nearly double the increase experienced by all ambulance trusts (+0.04). In other words, the gap between ambulance trusts and the rest of the NHS is both large, and growing.
- 4.2 The highest engagement score for an ambulance trust in the 2012 staff survey was 3.48, achieved by the South West Ambulance Service NHS Foundation Trust. The poorest performing ambulance trust for engagement was the East of England Ambulance Service NHS Trust with a score of 2.96. With a score of 3.20, YAS was positioned just below average for all ambulance trusts.
- 4.3 The average ambulance trust score for overall staff engagement compares less favourably with the average for all mental health trusts of 3.69, for community trusts of 3.69, all acute trusts 3.68 and acute specialist trusts of 3.84. All of the ambulance trusts, including YAS, come in the bottom decile in terms of overall staff engagement.
- 4.4 It is clearly the case that ambulance services operate in a distinct environment which poses particular challenges for staff; this is reflected in the fact that 32 per cent of ambulance staff have reported physical violence from patients and relatives (15 per cent for the NHS as a whole); and 48 per cent report bullying and abuse (30 per cent for the NHS as a whole). The shift patterns and remote/geographically dispersed working of staff poses a challenge in terms of engagement.

5. ACTION PLANNING FOR 2013 AND BEYOND

- 5.1 Ambulance trusts, including YAS, are well aware of the challenges that these figures pose. It is also increasingly recognised that it is vital that the service, as YAS specifically, is seen to be responding positively and proactively to the generic issues raised by low engagement scores.

- 5.2 Nevertheless the factors lying behind the engagement scores are likely to be complex, and are not yet sufficiently understood by the ambulance service nationally. The Government sponsored Macleod Review of 2009, Engaging for success: enhanced performance through employee engagement, indicated four key enablers of engagement:
- strong strategic narrative and mission with which staff identify;
 - engaging managers who lead, coach, appreciate and stretch their teams;
 - strong and effective employee voice both about task but also wider strategic issues such as quality of service and future planning;
 - organisational and culture integrity with the espoused values reflected in day to day behaviours throughout the organisation, enabling trust.
- 5.3 It is likely that an interplay of these factors, together with others arising from the particular history and traditions of the ambulance service, lie behind the engagement challenge facing all ambulance trusts, not just YAS.
- 5.4 As a consequence, the National Ambulance Service Directors of Human Resources Group is currently exploring the service wide implications of the staff survey results for 2012 and is in early exploratory discussions with Nita Clarke, co-author of the MacLeod review on employee engagement, led by the YAS Deputy Chief Executive, to determine what positive actions could be taken by the service to better understand the causes of engagement and disengagement of staff within the ambulance service.
- 5.5 In addition, a discussion relating to the organisational culture within the ambulance service is also due to be arranged between the Chief Allied Health Professions Officer at the Department of Health and the YAS Deputy Chief Executive, facilitated by the Director of NHS Employers, to explore opportunities for both the Department and NHS Employers to provide additional support to the ambulance service in respect of staff engagement during 2013/14.
- 5.6 Within YAS, the Trust's Directorate of Workforce & Strategy is currently analysing the detailed results from the 2012 Staff Survey to enable the production of Directorate specific reports and thereby enable individual Executive Directors and their Directorate Management Teams to address any specific issues within their portfolios. Additionally, the analysis of the results from the 2012 Staff Survey is being considered against the content of the 2 year organisational action plan, that the Trust Executive Group approved in 2012, to improve staff engagement to ensure that the organisation wide actions remain consistent with the need to further improve the levels of positive staff involvement and participation.

5.7 Whilst this process of analysis is underway, it was however recognised that the period in which the Staff Survey was undertaken in 2012 was a particularly challenging one for the Trust, whilst significant organisational restructuring and change was taking place and a major consultation in respect of proposed changes to the A&E workforce of the Trust was underway. These structural changes have subsequently been completed, in the main, or in the case of the 5 year A&E workforce plan are in the process of being implemented, following collective agreement being reached between the Trust and UNISON, as the recognised trade union representing the vast majority of ambulance service employees within Yorkshire.

5.8 Once the Trust has completed the internal analysis of the Staff Survey results for 2012 and the review of the organisational action plan, this will be the subject of formal reporting to and scrutiny by the Quality Committee of the Trust during the 2013/14 business plan period.

6.0 RECOMMENDATION

6.1 The report recommends that the Trust Board:

- The report recommends that the Trust Board receives and approves the results of the NHS Staff Survey for 2012.